The Bilingual Review
Vol. XXXVI • No 2 • August 2024
La Revista Bilingüe
Open-Access, Peer-Reviewed/Acceso Abierto, Jurado Profesional

Editor Introduction: Answerability in Dual Language Bilingual Education

Dan Heiman, PhD
University of Texas, El Paso

This special issue examines research in dual language bilingual education (DLBE) contexts that highlight the actions of critical consciousness and the answerability of research to the communities we work with/in as researchers and participants (Mangual Figueroa, 2024; Patel, 2016; San Pedro, 2021). Our aim is to historicize the participants in our research endeavors, moving beyond positioning them as informants to informing the way we (re)write their ways of being and knowing into our DLBE scholarship (Bhansari, 2023; Chaparro, 2020). Through a commitment to critically listening and attuning to our participants' ways of being and knowing in DLBE contexts (Alvarado, this issue), each contribution begins with an ethnographic account, which guides the theoretical, methodological, and linguistic structure. Each contribution is written in English, Spanish, or translanguaging as dictated through our critical listening and attuning to and historicizing of our participants. Data sets span diverse cartographies in the US, which is crucial amidst DLBE expansion and gentrification (Delavan et al., 2024; Palmer & García-Mateus, 2023), and the final contribution to the special issue is a visual representation of overarching themes and perspectives gleaned from the six articles, one poem, and concluding commentary.

In this concluding commentary, Claudia Cervantes-Soon emphasizes there are important vínculos between Leigh Patel's (2016) call for answerability to knowledge that is "useful at this moment, in this place" and Cervantes-Soon et al.'s (2017) call for the development of critical consciousness as a foundational goal in DLBE in response to inequities fueled by neoliberal logics that de-center the race radical roots of bilingual education (Cervantes-Soon, 2014; Flores, 2016). The "moment" that Cervantes-Soon et al. (2017) captured in their review of the DLBE literature was the emerging inequities at the sociopolitical, policy, and pedagogy levels that exposed the necessity of conceptualizing a fourth goal/pillar of critical consciousness for all DLBE stakeholders to go alongside the traditional goals of high academic achievement, bilingualism/biliteracy, and sociocultural competence.

This explicit call for the prioritizing of critical consciousness as a fundamental (Freire, 2020; Palmer et al., 2019) or foundational goal in DLBE (Heiman et al., 2024) have undoubtedly made valuable contributions to equity-minded research and continues to challenge the field amidst rapid expansion of DLBE programs, DLBE gentrification (Delavan et al., 2024; Palmer & García-Mateus, 2023; Valdez et al., 2016), and anti-Blackness (Blanton et al., 2021; Cioè-Peña, 2024; Frieson, 2021). At the same time, less is known about how DLBE researchers move beyond documentation to praxis alongside DLBE communities (Caldas & Pastraña, 2024; Cervantes-Soon

et al., 2017; Heiman et al., 2024). In our current DLBE "moment," marked by these dislocations, the contributors to this special issue demonstrate answerability from a variety of "place[s]" in the US and are critically attuned to the material effects of these and other dislocations (Alvarado, this issue; Patel, 2016). We are hopeful that readers of this special issue will find the knowledge "useful" for future praxis and research alongside DLBE educators, leaders, and supporters.

Jasmine Alvarado's three-year critical ethnography with/in the Mill City Dual Language School in a gentrifying community in the northeast US highlights her critical attunement to and acompañamiento alongside the raciolinguicized subjectivities (Daniels & Varghese, 2020) of mother/school aide, Flor, and her two children, Samuel and Melanie. Alvarado participated in Mill City as a substitute teacher, volunteer, principal intern, and doctoral researcher, which points to the myriad roles researchers may need to take in order to be answerable to their communities (Mangual Figueroa, 2024). In spite of carceral logics (Annamma, 2018) that shaped the schooling experiences of this Guatemalan family from Mill City and positioned them as lacking, Alvarado's integration of portraiture as (Lawrence-Lightfoot & Davis, 1997) interrogates these same carceral logics. Specifically, she weaves together her field notes, transcripts, and memos to describe how they "negotiate dominant discourses, or dominant viewpoints, relations, and approaches for family-school relations that permeate a DLBE program" (Alvarado, 2024, this issue). Alvarado demonstrates acompañamiento as a researcher by moving beyond documentation and critique by being there for the family through answering questions around school policies, technology support during pandemic schooling, and tutoring support for Samuel and Melanie. Through this portraiture and acompañamiento, Alvarado demonstrates a critical attunement to their manifestations of refusal of these carceral logics that is more than just critical listening. Alvarado is answerable to Flor by attuning to her strong desires to participate in her children's schooling processes and her keen knowledge about practices at Mill City, all while also being answerable to Samuel and Melanie by walking alongside them (literally and metaphorically) and documenting their goodness and brilliance.

Rachel Snyder Bhansari demonstrates answerability to her participants as part of her collaborative critical ethnography with first-year DLBE teachers of Color who she had taught during their teacher preparation journey in Washington state. As a white researcher who argues emotions are a key site for critical consciousness work in DLBE (Bhansari, 2023), she calls on other white researchers in DLBE to engage in a radical vulnerability alongside participants (Nagar, 2014), as this working with and through discomfort by different DLBE stakeholders is underexplored in the literature. An example of Bhansari's acompañamiento alongside these first-year teachers of Color was a Venn diagram activity they engaged in together as a way for them to name their emotions in and around being first-year DLBE teachers and how they drew connections between emotions, cultural knowledge, and knowledge of how to navigate the system. This activity revealed to Bhansari that this emotional work and working with (and through) discomfort is experienced in different ways as a white DLBE researcher and as first-year teachers of Color, with the stakes being higher for the latter. In spite of these first-year teachers describing deep frustration in their role at their DLBE communities, their hope and praxis highlights how critical consciousness is essential in DLBE contexts. Bhansari calls on DLBE researchers, especially white DLBE researchers, to acompañar their participants and include themselves in the process of building towards critical consciousness (Cervantes-Soon et al., 2017).

María Cioè-Peña and Justin Bullock (2024, this issue) provide a timely interdisciplinary collaboration from the fields of education and medicine as they "endeavor to think about ways that [they] as multilingual people—across positionalities and epistemologies, with and beyond educational settings—can forge new paths forward." This is precisely what Flores and Chaparro

(2018) urge us to do in forging paths against DLBE gentrification; specifically, they call for a language policy activism that requires more than educational and linguistic solutions through collaborations and contributions with/from local community and political organizations. Cioè-Peña's lived experiences and scholarship around the intersection of ableism, raciolinguistic ideologies, and anti-Blackness coupled with Bullock's lived experiences as a Black bipolar physician "whose fitness is often questioned" interrogates gatekeeping through a critical disabilities raciolinguistic (CDR) perspective in the fields of DLBE and medicine, respectively. This interrogation in their respective fields points to an ideology of language as "white property" (Chávez-Moreno, 2021) that serves as gatekeeping for racialized bilinguals in DLBE and in health care. Due to these gatekeeping practices, Cioè-Peña and Bullock conceptualize a goalkeeping that is grounded in the latter's experiences as a fútbol player. They propose "new ways forward" in the form of the *cancha* as a site of identity safety where everyone can create safety for each other and is sustained through coalition building, equity, and justice. This important interdisciplinary collaboration also highlights how sports can offer important insight into education and society more broadly (Carrillo, 2020; Carrillo & Gilliam, 2024).

As part of a larger collaborative ethnography in Milwaukee, Wisconsin that examined the tensions between school choice initiatives and bilingual education (Hurie & Palmer, 2022), Andrew Hurie historicizes the Gates Foundation small school initiative in the city, which has a rich history in activist movements in bilingual education while also, ironically, being a pioneer in school choice initiatives. Written in Spanish as a form of gratitude and commitment to the longstanding bilingual education community in Milwaukee, Hurie demonstrates critical attunement (Alvarado, this issue) to the experiences and historicizing of renowned bilingual education activist Tony Báez and provides an exhaustive analysis of historical archives of how Gates' venture philanthropy impacted bilingual education in the city. Hurie's research uncovered how only 2.4% of the Gates Foundation small schools offered bilingual programming in a city with a long, rich, and critical tradition of bilingual education and commitment to serving racialized bilinguals. This intergenerational dialogue with Báez and historical analysis revealed how venture philanthropy and its creation of small schools was a barrier to community control through the silencing of the voices of racialized bilinguals and lack of critical attunement to the self-determination of the longstanding bilingual education community in the city and activists like Báez. Hurie's revisiting of his own research for this article and his answerability to the bilingual education community of Milwaukee highlights the necessity of engaging in collaboration and critical listening and attunement alongside participants. By asking "how" this all happened instead of "what" happened in Milwaukee, we see how Hurie reveals how historicizing is an essential action of answerability in DLBE.

Sofía Chaparro revisits the "fertile grounds" of her ethnographic research in a gentrifying Philadelphia community that examined the inner workings of how a DLBE school took root and the complexities around the integration of recent immigrants from Latin America and the privileged (mostly) white community (Chaparro, 2021). This "perfect storm" set the backdrop for what she described as a "raciolinguistic socialization" that positioned students from these two distinct communities differently in their language and literacy abilities (Chaparro, 2019) and served as inspiration to move beyond critique and be more answerable to the immigrant community through her article in the special issue. In looking to invoke a way forward in DLBE through a "freedom dreaming" (Love, 2019) that reimagines cross-cultural friendships as "fertile grounds" for coalition-building spaces for social justice in DLBE, Chaparro dreams up a poem that is inspired by her interactions and learnings alongside students from the two communities. In this poem, one student, Larissa, implores her classmate, Zoe, to leverage her privilege and walk alongside the immigrant community by taking up the role of a co-conspirator to reconfigure these "fertile grounds" into

coalition-building spaces for social justice in integrated DLBE programs. Chaparro demonstrates answerability to the immigrant community of Philadelphia, alongside whom she researched, while also calling on DLBE constituents with more societal power to engage with the actions of critical consciousness by de-centering their own personal interests and critically attuning to the immigrant community (Flores, 2024).

Kathryn Henderson's contribution to the special issue aims to discover the "*Whys*" in DLBE as she revisits pláticas (Guajardo et al., 2016) from a padre de familia, an assistant principal, a maestra de tercer grado, and her own "*Why*" as a researcher who is determined to be more answerable to the DLBE community at the Writer Academy. Henderson's integration of these pláticas with an educator, leader, and supporter around their unique "*Whys*" in DLBE poignantly captures how they historicize their experiences while also offering critical and hopeful perspectives that also reflect their own language practices. These "*Whys*" include how learning Spanish instills a sense of pride as opposed to being a luxury for the padre de familia, how an assistant principal is guided by what the research says and tireless advocacy to support DLBE en comunidad with others, and how a maestra de tercer grado and former normalista de México experienced, firsthand, the learnings she was offered in a DLBE context and who wants to pass this on to her students. Henderson, much like Bhansari, works with and through discomfort by describing her own experiences as a white substitute teacher, parent, and researcher in the school who is striving to critically attune to the on-the-ground realities of teachers, which had previously been elusive due to the demands of academia. Through these "*Whys*" and her own commitment to be answerable to DLBE educators, leaders, and supporters at Writer Academy, she reminds us through the words of the assistant principal that "the solutions are out there; all we have to do es escuchar."

We conclude the special issue with a reflection poem by Sue Kasun based on the six articles described above and a concluding commentary by Claudia Cervantes-Soon, who, along with her co-authors, call us to action through humanizing research "where children, parents, and researchers work alongside each other… to dismantle [DLBE] inequities" (Cervantes-Soon et al., 2017, p. 421). Finally, Martha Samaniego Calderón provides a visual representation of the different contributions to the special issue.

References

Annamma, S. A. (2018). Mapping consequential geographies in the carceral state: Education journey mapping as a qualitative method with girls of color with dis/abilities. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *24*(1), 20-34. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800417728962

Bhansari, R. (2023). A collective journey: Coalitional critical consciousness and collaborative methodologies in bilingual teacher education. *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*. https://doi.org/10.1111/aeq.12453

Blanton, A., Kasun, G. S., Gambrell, J. A., & Espinosa, Z. (2021). A Black mother's counterstory to the Brown-White binary in dual language education: Toward disrupting dual language as White property. *Language Policy, online first*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10993-021-09582-4

Caldas Chumbes, B., & Pastrana, C. (2024). TLESSS: Filling the Ethnic Studies Gap in Bilingual Teacher Education in the Midwest. *Departures in Critical Qualitative Research*, *13*(2), 97-116. https://doi.org/10.1525/dcqr.2024.13.2.97

Carrillo, J. F. (2020). Hoops and "education": Latino males, fugitivity, and basketball in the city. *Urban Education*, *59*(1), 1-26. https://doi.org/10.1177/0042085920966368

Carrillo, J. F., & Gilliam, C. (2024). Boyhood masculinities at play: Basketball, learning, and the pedagogies of the court. *International Journal of Educational Research, 126*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2024.102361

Cervantes-Soon, C. G. (2014). A critical look at dual language immersion in the new Latin@ diaspora. *Bilingual Research Journal*, *37*(1), 64-82. https://doi.org/10.1080/15235882.2014.893267.

Cervantes-Soon, C. G., Dorner, L., Palmer, D., Heiman, D., Schwerdtfeger, R., & Choi, J. (2017). Combating inequalities in two-way language immersion programs: Toward critical consciousness in bilingual education spaces. *Review of Research in Education*, *41*(1), 403-427. https://doi.org/10.3102/0091732X17690120

Chaparro, S. (2021) Creating fertile grounds for a TWI program: Gentrification, immigration, and neoliberal school reforms. *Language Policy*, *20*(3), 435-461. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10993-020-09576-8

Chaparro, S. E. (2020). Pero aquí se habla inglés: Latina immigrant mothers' experiences of discrimination, resistance, and pride through antropoesía. *TESOL Quarterly*, *54*(3), 599-628. https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.593

Chaparro, S. (2019). But mom! I'm not a Spanish boy: Raciolinguistic socialization in a two-way immersion bilingual program. *Linguistics and Education*, 50, 1-12. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.linged.2019.01.003

Chávez-Moreno, L. (2021). Dual language as white property: Examining a secondary bilingual education program and Latinx equity. *American Educational Research Journal*, *58*(6), 1107-1141. https://doi.org/10.3102/00028312211052508

Cioè-Peña, M. (2024). Writing, rioting, and righting como Negra: A testimonio of Black Latinx erasure in bilingual education. *Harvard Educational Review*, *94*(1), 1-15. http://dx.doi.org/10.17763/1943-5045-94.1.1

Daniels, J. R., & Varghese, M. (2020). Troubling practice: Exploring the relationship between Whiteness and practice-based teacher education in considering a raciolinguicized teacher subjectivity. *Educational Researcher*, *49*(1), 56-63. https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X19879450

Delavan, M. G., Freire, J., & Menken, K. (Eds.). (2024). *Overcoming the gentrification of*

dual language, bilingual, and immersion education: Solution-oriented research and stakeholder resources. Multilingual Matters.
Flores, N. (2024). Nice White parents and dual language education. In M.G. Delavan, J. Freire, & K. Menken (Eds.), *Overcoming the gentrification of dual language, bilingual, and immersion education: Solution-oriented research and stakeholder resources* (pp. 259-261). Multilingual Matters.
Flores, N. (2016). A tale of two visions: Hegemonic Whiteness and bilingual education. *Educational Policy*, *30*(1), 13-38. https://doi.org/10.1177/0895904815616482
Flores, N., & Chaparro, S. (2018). What counts as language education policy?: Developing a materialist anti-racist approach to language activism. *Language Policy*, *17*(3), 365-384. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10993-017-9433-7
Freire, J. A. (2020). Promoting sociopolitical consciousness and bicultural goals of dual language education: The transformational dual language educational framework. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, 1-16. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/15348458.2019.1672174
Frieson, B. L. (2021). Remixin' and flowin' in centros: Exploring the biliteracy practices of Black language speakers in an elementary two-way immersion bilingual program. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, *25*(4), 1-21. https://doi.org/10.1080/13613324.2021.1890568
Guajardo, M., Guajardo, F., Militello, M., & Janson, C. (2016). *Reframing community partnerships in education: Uniting the power of place and wisdom of people*. Routledge Press.
Heiman, D., Nuñez-Janes, M., Solano, I., Rosales, C., & Ortega, M. F. (2024). *Críticos, no criticones*: Applying the actions of critical consciousness in an interdisciplinary collaboration across two universities and a school district's dual language/ESL department. In M.G. Delavan, J. Freire, & K. Menken (Eds.), *Overcoming the gentrification of dual language, bilingual, and immersion education: Solution-oriented research and stakeholder resources* (pp. 212-234). Multilingual Matters.
Heiman, D., Cervantes-Soon, C., Palmer, D.K., & Dorner, L.M. (2023). Creating a transformative foundation for dual language bilingual education: Critical consciousness at the core. In J.A. Freire, C. Alfaro, & E.de Jong (Eds.), *The handbook of dual language bilingual education* (pp. 51-71). Routledge.
Hurie, A. H., & Palmer, D. K. (2022). Selling and resisting English-medium schooling on Milwaukee's multilingual Near South Side: A typology of choice schools' marketing strategies. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, *30*(28), 1-30. https://doi.org/10.14507/epaa.30.6359
Lawrence-Lightfoot, S., & Davis, J. H. (1997). *The art and science of portraiture.* Jossey-Bass.
Love, B. L. (2019). *We want to do more than survive: Abolitionist teaching and the pursuit of educational freedom*. Beacon Press.
Mangual Figueroa, M. (2024). *Knowing silence: How children talk about immigration status in school.* University of Minnesota Press.
Nagar, R. (2014) *Muddying the Waters: Co-authoring Feminisms across Scholarship and Activism*. University of Illinois Press.
Palmer, D., & García-Mateus, S. (Eds.). (2023). *Gentrification and bilingual education: A Texas TWBE school across seven years*. Lexington Books.
Patel, L. (2016). *Decolonizing educational research: From ownership to answerability*. Routledge.
San Pedro, T. (2021). *Protecting the promise: Indigenous education between mothers and their children*. Teachers College Press.

Valdez, V. E., Freire, J. A., & Delavan, M. G. (2016). The gentrification of dual language education. *The Urban Review*, *48*(4), 601-627. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-016-0370-0